

Reinhart Boerner Van Deuren s.c. P.O. Box 2965 Milwaukee, WI 53201-2965

1000 North Water Street Suite 1700 Milwaukee, WI 53202

Telephone: 414-298-1000 Fax: 414-298-8097 Toll Free: 800-553-6215 reinhartlaw.com

October 3, 2011

DECEIVED

Jeffrey P. Clark Direct Dial: 414-298-8131 jclark@reinhartlaw.com

DELIVERED BY COURIER

Regional Hearing Clerk (E-19J) U.S. EPA, Region 5 77 West Jackson Boulevard Chicago, IL 60604 REGIONAL HEARING CLERK U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

Dear Regional Hearing Clerk:

Re: *In the Matter of Liphatech, Inc.*Docket No. FIFRA-05-2010-0016

On behalf of Respondent, Liphatech, Inc., I enclose for filing an original and two copies of Respondent's Opposition to Complainant's Motion For Leave to File Motion For Leave To File Sixth Supplemental Prehearing Exchange.

Please file-stamp one of the enclosed copies and kindly return it to me in the enclosed postage-prepaid envelope. Thank you for your assistance.

Respectfully submitted,

Jeffrey A. Clark

Jeffrey P. Clark

REINHART\7862170

Encs.

cc Honorable Susan L. Biro (w/encs., by courier)
Ms. Nidhi K. O'Meara (C-14J) (w/encs., by courier)

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION 5

In the Matter of:) Docket No. F	Docket No. FIFRA-05-2010-0016	
Liphatech, Inc.) Hon. Susan l	Biro	
Milwaukee, Wisconsin,)	DECEIVEM	
Respondent.)	\mathcal{M}	
)	OCT 0 4 2011	

RESPONDENT'S OPPOSITION TO COMPLAINANT'S MOTION FOR CHANGENCY TO FILE MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE SIXTH SUPPLEMENTAL PREHEARING EXCHANGE

Respondent, Liphatech, Inc., through its undersigned attorneys, respectfully submits its Opposition to Complainant's Motion for Leave to File Motion for Leave To File Sixth Supplemental Prehearing Exchange Instanter (the "Motion") pursuant to Section 22.16 of the Consolidated Rules.

On September 29, 2011, Complainant filed the Motion. According to the Presiding Officer's Order Scheduling Hearing, dated June 10, 2011 (the "Order"), the Presiding Officer required the parties to file all pre-hearing motions, including motions to supplement the pre-hearing exchange, on or before August 31, 2011. Despite the Order, Complainant now attempts to supplement its pre-hearing exchange with documents that were, according to Complainant, printed from Respondent's website on February 25, 2010.

Accordingly, Complainant's proposed Exhibit 150 was in Complainant's possession when it filed its Initial Prehearing Exchange on September 28, 2010; its Rebuttal Prehearing Exchange on November 10, 2010; its First Supplemental

Prehearing Exchange on January 25, 2011; its Second Supplemental Prehearing Exchange on February 28, 2011; its Third and Fourth Supplemental Prehearing Exchanges on August 19, 2011; and its Fifth Supplemental Prehearing Exchange on August 30, 2011.

"Inadvertent oversight" is not enough to overcome non-compliance with the Order. See Jiffy Builders, Inc., 8 E.A.D. 315, 320 n. 8 (EAB 1999) (the fact that failure to comply was not purposeful is not enough to show cause). Complainant was previously given, even after issuance of the Order on June 10, 2011 Order, sufficient time to supplement its pre-hearing exchange and has not shown justification for its failure to comply with the deadlines set forth in the Order. The Motion should be denied.

Dated this 3 whay of October, 2011.

Respectfully submitted,

Reinhart Boerner Van Deuren s.c. 1000 North Water Street, Suite 1700 Milwaukee, WI 53202

Telephone: 414-298-1000

Facsimile: 414-298-8097

Mailing Address: P.O. Box 2965

Milwaukee, WI 53201-2965

Michael H. Simpson

WI State Bar ID No. 1014363 msimpson@reinhartlaw.com

Jeffrey P. Clark

WI State Bar ID No. 1009316

jclark@reinhartlaw.com

Lucas N. Roe

WI State Bar ID No. 1069233

lroe@reinhartlaw.com

Attorneys for Respondent Liphatech, Inc.



REGIONAL HEARING CLERK U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

Docket No. FIFRA-05-2010-0016 *In the Matter of Liphatech, Inc.*

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Jeffrey P. Clark, one of the attorneys for the Respondent, Liphatech, Inc., hereby certify that I delivered one copy of the foregoing Respondent's Opposition To Complainant's Motion For Leave To File Sixth Supplemental Prehearing Exchange, to the persons designated below, by depositing it with a commercial delivery service, postage prepaid, at Milwaukee, Wisconsin, in envelopes addressed to:

Honorable Susan L. Biro Office of the Administrative Law Judges Franklin Court Building 1099 14th Street, NW, Suite 350 Washington, D.C. 20005; and

Ms. Nidhi K. O'Meara (C-14J) Office of Regional Counsel U.S. EPA, Region 5 77 West Jackson Boulevard Chicago, IL 60604



REGIONAL HEARING CLERK U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

I further certify that I filed the original and one copy of the Respondent's Opposition to Complainant's Motion For Leave to File Sixth Supplemental Prehearing Exchange and the original of this Certificate of Service in the Office of the Regional Hearing Clerk, U.S. EPA, Region 5, 77 West Jackson Boulevard, Chicago, Illinois 60604, by depositing them with a commercial delivery service, postage prepaid, at Milwaukee, Wisconsin, on the date below.

Dated this 3 day of October, 2011

Jeffrey P. Clark

One of the Attorneys for Respondent Liphatech, Inc.